CPE Applicant Comparison

	.MUSIC	Score	.SPA	Score	.HOTEL	Score	.ECO	Score	.OSAKA	Score	.RADIO	Score	.GAY	Score
Definition	Strictly delineated and organized, logical alliance of communitiesof similar nature that relate to music (20A)		"The spa community primarily includes: Spa operators, professionals and practitioners; Spa associations and their members around the world; Spa products and services manufacturers and distributors. The secondary community generally also includes holistic and personal wellness centers and organizations. While these secondary community organizations do not relate directly to .spas, they nevertheless often overlap with and participate in the spa community and may share certain benefits for the utilization of the .spa domain" (20A)		"a logical alliance of members, with the associations and the marketing organizations maintaining membership lists, directories and registers that can be used, among other public lists, directories and registers, to verify eligibility against the .hotel Eligility requirements" (20A)		"Members of the [environmental] Community are delineated from Internet users generally by community-recognized memberships, accreditations, registrations, and certifications that demonstrate active commitment, practice and reporting" (20A)		"Members of the community are defined as those who are within the Osaka geographical area as well as those who self identify as having a tie to Osaka, or the culture of Osaka. Major participants of the community include, but are not limited to the following: Legal entities; Citizens; Governments and public sectors; Entities, including natural persons who have a legitimate purpose in addressing the community"(20A)		"The Radio industry is composed of a huge number of very diverse radio broadcasters: public and private; international and local; commercial or community-oriented; general purpose, or sector-specific; talk or music; big and small. All licensed radio broadcasters are part of the .radio community, and so are the associations, federations and unions they have created. Also included are the radio professionals, those making radio the fundamental communications tool that it is." (20A)		"The Gay Community includes individuals who identify themselves as male or female homosexuals, bisexual, transgender, queer, intersex, ally." (20A)	
Cohesion / Awareness	The .MUSIC CPE Report states: "While individuals within some of the member categories may show cohesion within a category or across a subset of the member categories, the number of individuals included in the defined community that do not show such cohesion is considerable enough that the community defined as a whole cannot be said to have the cohesion" (.MUSIC CPE Report, p.3). All music categories and subsets have cohesion because they all operate under a regulated sector and subject to united standards relating to copyright law. The ICANN Board approved GAC Category 1 Advice Safeguards accepting that the .MUSIC string has cohesion under a regulated sector. Further, DotMusic notes that the vast majority of the "logical alliance" Music Community defined are musicians and artists, who are clearly defined. As such, ICANN's subjective measure of "not considerable enough" is statistically insignificant. ICANN does not document nor substantiate its "conclusion" with any "compelling and defensible" evidence as required by the Guidelines.	**No**	"Members…recognize themselves as part of the spa community as evidenced…by their inclusion in industry organizations and participation in their events" (.SPA CPE Report, p.2). In contrast, ICANN rejected DotMusic's membership music categories and music subsets as not having the requisite awareness even though, similar to the spa community, all Music Community members also "participate" in music-related events and are included in music groups or music subsets.	**Yes**	"[T]he community is defined in terms of its association with the hotel industry and the provision of specific hotel services" (.HOTEL CPE Report, p.2). Conversely, ICANN disregarded DotMusic's "logical alliance" community definition, which is also similarly defined in terms of its association with a cohesive logical alliance. The .HOTEL definition was also a "logical alliance of members."	**Yes**	"Cohesion and awareness is founded in…demonstrable involvement in environmental activities" which "may vary among member categories" (.ECO CPE Report, p.2). Conversely, the EIU penalized DotMusic with a grade of zero based on similar category variance and members that also have demonstrable involvement in music-related activities.	**Yes**	ICANN determined the Osaka community defined had "cohesion" because members "self identify as having a tie to Osaka, or the culture of Osaka" (.OSAKA CPE Report, p.2). Similarly, DotMusic's "logical alliance" is "related to music" (i.e. has a tie to music) but its Application was penalized with zero points.	**Yes**	ICANN established that the radio community had cohesion solely on the basis of being "participants in …[radio] industry" (.RADIO CPE Report, p.2). Conversely, DotMusic was not given any points even though its music community members in its delineated member music categories and music subsets participate in the music industry as well, yet ICANN penalized DotMusic with zero points.	**Yes**	ICANN determined that stronger cohesion than DotMusic based on "an implicit recognition and awareness of belonging to a community of others who have come out as having non-normative sexual orientations or gender identities, or as their allies" (emphasis added) (.GAY CPE Report, p.2). In contradiction, ICANN determined DotMusic's "logical alliance" operating under a regulated sector that is united by copyright lacked any "cohesion" of belonging to a community and was penalized with zero points.	**Yes**
Mainly Dedicated Organisation	Globally-Recognized organizations include the International Federation of Musicians (has United Nations consultative status), the International Federation of the Phonographic Industry (has United Nations consultative status and administers the ISRC international standard code for uniquely identifying sound recordings and music video recordings under ISO 3901), the International Federation of Arts Councils and Culture Agencies (IFACCA) and ReverbNation (representing all music categories and music subsets in their entirety in over 100 countries)	**No**	International Spa Association (.SPA CPE Report, p.2)	**Yes**	China Hotel Association ("CHA") (.HOTEL CPE Report, p.2). ICANN determined that CHA representing hotels in one country, China, is a recognized organization mainly dedicated to the hotel community in its entirety. Conversely, ICANN penalized DotMusic giving zero points because "there is no single entity that serves all of these categories in all their geographic breadth." (.MUSIC CPE Report, p.5) DotMusic has many such entities.	**Yes**	Global Reporting Initiative (.ECO CPE Report, p.3)	**Yes**							International Lesbian, Gay, Bisexual, Trans and Intersex Association (.GAY CPE Report, p.3)	**Yes**
Prexistence and Longevity	"The community as defined in the application was not active prior to September 2007" (.MUSIC CPE Report). The "logical alliance of communities that relate to music" (the defined community in 20A) existed before 2007. The string's cohesive regulated sector and copyright existed before 2007. DotMusic's supporting organizations, the IFPI and the FIM were founded in 1933 and 1948 respectively.	**No**	**Yes.**	**Yes**	**Yes.**	**Yes**	**Yes.**	**Yes**	**Yes.**	**Yes**	**Yes.**	**Yes**	**Yes.**	**Yes**
Community Establishment	**No.**	**0/4**	**Yes.**	**4/4**	**Yes.**	**4/4**	**Yes.**	**4/4**	**Yes.**	**4/4**			**Yes.**	**4/4**
Nexus	"[t]here is no "established name" for the applied-for string to match…for a full score on Nexus" (.MUSIC CPE Report, p.5). ICANN disregarded the established name of the community given in DotMusic's Application that entirely matches the string: "The name of the community served is the "Music Community" ("Community")... "MUSIC" matches the name of the Community entirely...The "MUSIC" string matches the name ("Name") of the Community and is the established name by which the Community is commonly known by others." (20A). "The .MUSIC string relates to the Community by [c]ompletely representing the entire Community" (20D)	**3/4**	The "secondary community" that "do[es] not relate directly to…spas" (20A) subset of the community, along with the principal spa community…"meets the requirement for "match" with regard to Nexus" (.SPA CPE Report, p.5)	**4/4**					"The string, ".osaka", directly represents the Osaka community" (.OSAKA CPE Report, p.2). Similarly, the string ".music" directly represents the "Music Community," the established name in DotMusic's Application for the community. Yet, ICANN penalized DotMusic with a loss of a point.	**4/4**				
Support	DotMusic has support from organizations with members that represent over 95% of music consumed globally in its community defined. DotMusic meets the criterion of having "support from institutions/organizations representing a majority of the community addressed," which ICANN disregarded and did not apply (that would have awarded DotMusic a total of 2 points).	**1/2**			"[T]hese groups constitute…a majority of the overall community as described by the applicant" (.HOTEL CPE Report, p.6).	**2/2**					"[T]he applicant possesses documented support from institutions/organizations representing a majority of the community addressed" (.RADIO CPE Report, p.7).	**2/2**		
Application	Link		Link		Link		Link		Link		Link		Link	